

Effectiveness of Online Licensing Services on MSME Development: A Case Study of DPMPTSP Sidoarjo Regency

Lefan Afitra Ferdiansah¹, Ani Rustianingsih²
^{1,2}Muhammadiyah University of Sidoarjo, Indonesia



DOI: <https://doi.org/10.61796/icossh.v2i4.567>



Sections Info

Article history:

Submitted: October 31, 2025
Final Revised: November 15, 2025
Accepted: November 30, 2025
Published: December 10, 2025

Keywords:

Online Single Submission (OSS)
Online licensing
Micro Small and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs)
Organizational effectiveness

ABSTRACT

Objective: This study examines the effectiveness of online licensing services through the Online Single Submission (OSS) system in supporting the development of Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) in Sidoarjo Regency. **Method:** A qualitative method with a case study approach was applied, involving MSME actors and DPMPTSP officers through interviews, observations, and document collection. **Results:** The findings indicate that OSS simplifies the licensing process, enhances transparency, and accelerates the issuance of Business Identification Numbers (NIB). However, the main challenges identified include low levels of digital literacy and insufficient technical support, particularly for micro-enterprises in rural areas. The analysis employs Budiani's effectiveness theory and Richard M. Steers' concept of organizational effectiveness, which emphasizes that an organization's success can be assessed by the extent to which individual behavior and institutional structures work in harmony to achieve predetermined goals. The results show that the indicators of socialization and monitoring function relatively well, while target accuracy and clarity of objectives still need improvement. **Novelty:** This study suggests enhancing digital literacy, simplifying the system, and providing continuous assistance to ensure that OSS becomes more inclusive and responsive to the needs of MSMEs in the region.

INTRODUCTION

Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) play a crucial role in Indonesia's economy, contributing over 60% to the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) and employing around 97% of the workforce in the country [1]. However, one significant obstacle still faced by MSMEs is the complicated, bureaucratic, and time-consuming licensing process. As a result, many business owners are hesitant to officially register their enterprises, leading to a loss of access to various support services such as business loans, training, and broader market opportunities [2].

As a response to these challenges, the government has introduced the Online Single Submission (OSS) system, managed by the Investment Coordinating Board and One-Stop Integrated Services (DPMPTSP). The purpose of OSS is to streamline the licensing process and enhance service transparency, allowing business operators to submit applications online without the need to physically visit service offices [3]. This policy references Government Regulation Number 24 of 2018 concerning Integrated Electronic Business Licensing Services and Government Regulation Number 5 of 2021 related to Risk-Based Business Licensing Implementation [4] Electronic Business Licensing Services and Government Regulation Number 5 of 2021 related to Risk-Based Business Licensing Implementation [5].

Table 1. Data on the Number of UMKM NIB Issuances through OSS in Sidoarjo Regency.

Year	Number of NIB Issued	Description
2020	512	Initial implementation of OSS, dominated by medium-sized enterprises.
2021	805	DPMPTSP intensified OSS socialization to micro and small businesses.
2022	1,009	An active "jemput bola" (proactive outreach) program was implemented in 12 districts.
2023	1,235	Service optimization through collaboration with village and sub-district governments.

Source; DPMPTSP kabupaten sidoarjo,2023.

The increasing number of NIB issuances through the OSS system in Sidoarjo demonstrates a positive reaction from the community. This is evident in the data showing that in 2020, a total of 512 NIBs were issued during the initial implementation of OSS, primarily by medium-sized businesses. In 2021, this figure rose to 805 due to active outreach conducted by DPMPTSP. The year 2022 reported 1,009 NIBs issued, attributed to proactive engagement in 12 sub-districts. By 2023, this number climbed further to 1,235 following collaboration between DPMPTSP and local villages and neighborhoods. This information clearly indicates a significant annual rise in the issuance of business identification numbers (NIB) [6]. These findings suggest that collaborative and participatory approaches make a meaningful contribution to improving access to licensing services. The on-the-ground outreach strategy and the collaboration between local government and community members have proven to be effective in reaching MSME actors who previously had limited access to the online licensing system [7].

In terms of OSS implementation in Sidoarjo, DPMPTSP has successfully issued over 1,009 NIBs through its outreach programs. According to a DPMPTSP survey conducted in 2022, approximately 70% of business actors reported satisfaction with the ease of using the OSS system for registration [8]. Nonetheless, challenges remain, including a low understanding of procedures and limited technology use among some MSME actors [9].

Similar issues have arisen across different applications of the OSS system based on field observations. While OSS has the potential to enhance the efficiency of licensing services, there are still hurdles in its execution. The information provided within the system is often insufficient, and certain features have not yet reached optimal performance [10]. Furthermore, digital service offerings have not been fully integrated; there are still specific stages that require applicants to appear in person. This situation complicates matters for business owners located far from service centers, conflicting with

the electronic service principles of OSS. Additionally, while the e-government approach in OSS implementation has promoted greater transparency, other barriers persist, such as uneven access to information and inconsistencies in regulations across sectors and regions. This illustrates that the success of the OSS system relies not only on the availability of technology but also on the readiness of regulations, human resources, and adequate institutional support [11].

This study utilizes the effectiveness theory from Budiani and the organizational effectiveness theory presented by Richard M. Steers in his work titled *Organizational Effectiveness: A Behavioral View*, which emphasizes that the success of an organization can be gauged by how well individual behaviors and institutional structures collaborate to achieve established goals such as quality, productivity, satisfaction, motivation, and adaptation. These elements serve as evaluation tools to analyze OSS services in detail. This theory highlights four primary indicators of effectiveness that will guide the discussion: (1) program targeting accuracy, (2) program socialization, (3) goal clarity, and (4) program monitoring. These four indicators form a crucial basis for assessing public policy effectiveness in a structured and comprehensive manner [12]. To delve deeper into these indicators, Budiani clarifies that program targeting accuracy relates to how closely beneficiaries align with predetermined objectives. Program socialization is vital for ensuring the community understands the existence, aims, and operation of the services. Goal clarity necessitates proper planning with realistic, measurable, and attainable targets. Meanwhile, program monitoring emphasizes the need for ongoing supervision and evaluation to ensure that service implementation aligns with plans and positively impacts the community.

This research draws on several prior studies, including the work by Damayanti [13]. regarding UMKM guidance in NIB registration through OSS, Hapsari and Meirinawati which examines strategies to enhance public services via OSS at DPMPSTP Sidoarjo [14]. The research Nisak and Hertati who discuss the effectiveness of SIPPADU in Sidoarjo as a comparison with OSS [15]. Additionally, research conducted by Christiawan investigates OSS as a tool to facilitate business operations. However, the author notes that studies specifically applying Budiani's effectiveness theory to analyze OSS comprehensively are quite limited, making this research unique by linking OSS effectiveness with the digital readiness of UMKM actors at the regional level.

Furthermore, in terms of the implementing organization's alignment, effectiveness is significantly influenced by the presence of a competent team, clear and effective implementation procedures, and technical as well as administrative capacities that meet program demands. For the target group's alignment, the indicators used include the compatibility of the target group's needs with the program's content, active participation in the implementation process, and the ability to optimally utilize the program's outcomes. Given this background, the study aims to address the key question: To what extent is the effectiveness of online licensing services in supporting UMKM development in Sidoarjo District? By gaining deeper insights into the effectiveness of this system, it is hoped that the research can provide valuable recommendations for the local government

to enhance digital licensing services to be more inclusive, efficient, and responsive to the needs of UMKM.

RESEARCH METHOD

This study employs a qualitative approach with a case study method to assess the effectiveness of online licensing services via the Online Single Submission (OSS) system in aiding the development of Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) [16]. This approach was chosen because it allows for an in-depth exploration of the experiences, perceptions, and challenges faced by MSME operators when using OSS [17]. The aim of qualitative research is to understand social realities from the perspectives of the subjects being examined, through the collection of narrative and descriptive data along with interpretative analysis. Thus, this approach is deemed suitable for uncovering the meaning and context of OSS usage in business licensing services [18]. The research site was selected in an area that serves as a center for licensing services, with research participants including MSME operators utilizing OSS, officials from the One Stop Investment and Integrated Service Agency (DPMPTSP), and other stakeholders involved in the system's implementation [19]. Informant selection was carried out deliberately, considering that they possess relevant experience and understanding of the research topic. Data collection techniques included in-depth interviews with MSME operators and DPMPTSP officials to gather insights concerning their challenges, experiences, and views on the effectiveness of OSS; direct observation of the process of using OSS for licensing purposes; and documentation that encompasses related regulations, government agency reports, and previous research findings. The gathered data was analyzed using thematic analysis to categorize the information into primary themes that emerged from interviews, observations, and documentation. This analysis aims to identify patterns reflecting the effectiveness, obstacles, and opportunities within the implementation of OSS. Theoretically, this research utilizes the public policy effectiveness theory as an evaluative framework to assess OSS services [20]. This framework emphasizes four main indicators of effectiveness: program targeting accuracy, program socialization, clarity of objectives, and program monitoring. By applying this framework, the study aims to provide a comprehensive overview of the effectiveness of the OSS system in supporting MSME development [21].

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The organizational effectiveness theory presented by Richard M. Steers in 1977 through his work "Organizational Effectiveness: A Behavioral View" highlights that an organization's success can be evaluated based on how well individual behavior and institutional structure work together to achieve established goals. Steers underscores the significance of aligning input, process, and output within an organization as a crucial element in realizing effectiveness. This perspective complements the program effectiveness theory put forth by Budiani in 2007, which details four primary indicators to evaluate a program's effectiveness: the accuracy of targeting, socialization, clarity of

objectives, and monitoring and control of the program. The accuracy of targeting emphasizes the importance of the match between beneficiaries and the defined goals, while program socialization focuses on spreading clear and equitable information so that the community understands the policy's aims and functioning. Clarity of objectives is essential to avoid ambiguity in program execution, and program monitoring is meant to ensure ongoing oversight, allowing implementation to remain adaptable to the dynamics in the field. In relation to this study, both theoretical frameworks serve as a basis for assessing the effectiveness of public service digitization programs, including the OSS system, with findings indicating positive outcomes in several indicators, although there is still room for improvement regarding infrastructure enhancement, human resource capacity building, and broader socialization to the community.

Accuracy of Program Targeting

The indicator that assesses the accuracy of program targeting reveals that the OSS in Sidoarjo has succeeded in reaching SMEs as the primary target, as evidenced by the statistics showing an annual increase in the issuance of Business Identification Numbers (NIB). In 2020, 512 NIBs were issued, mostly aimed at medium enterprises during the initial implementation, indicating that the early priority was given to groups that were more prepared for digital engagement. This number rose to 805 NIBs in 2021 and reached 1,009 in 2022 through proactive outreach efforts, indicating a broader reach towards small and micro SMEs in rural areas. By 2023, the total NIBs increased to 1,235, bolstered by collaboration with local government offices, strengthening the alignment of targeting with local needs for SMEs. However, challenges such as a lack of digital understanding among micro SMEs highlight that improvements are needed in targeting to be more inclusive, especially for business owners with low technology literacy, which means not all potential targets are adequately served. Previous research by Christiawan in 2021 supports this finding, noting that while OSS simplifies the business licensing process, there are still deficiencies in providing necessary technical permits for small SMEs that are often not fully integrated into the system, thus diminishing targeting accuracy for low-risk business groups. Additionally, Nisak and Hertati in 2024, in a comparison with SIPPADU in Sidoarjo, emphasize that the success of targeting relies on an understanding of the program, where systems like OSS need to adapt to user capabilities to achieve more precise objectives, similar to the inclusivity challenges faced by SIPPADU.

Socialization of the Program

The services offered by DPMPTSP of Sidoarjo in issuing business licenses through the OSS system are apparent in the consistent application of standard operational procedures (SOP) that govern the speed of license completion. According to the service metrics, the average time to issue a Business Identification Number (NIB) can be accomplished within a single working day, in accordance with the SOP, and in some instances even faster due to the support of an integrated digital system. This achievement demonstrates that DPMPTSP can maintain the effectiveness and efficiency of the licensing process continuously, ensuring satisfaction for agencies in terms of service

delivery in accordance with the SOP, along with heightened participation from micro, small, and medium enterprises (MSMEs) through the OSS socialization program.

In line with this, DPMPTSP also carries out socialization of the OSS program with a proactive strategy to enhance public understanding. In 2021, intensive socialization led to an increase in NIB issuance, which was further strengthened by an outreach approach in 2022, and collaborative efforts with sub-districts and villages in 2023, successfully reaching a greater number of MSMEs. A public satisfaction survey conducted in 2022 revealed that approximately 70% of business actors expressed satisfaction with the accessibility and speed of OSS services, reflecting the success of socialization in raising awareness and involvement among entrepreneurs.

Nonetheless, challenges remain regarding the equitable distribution of information access, particularly in rural areas. Therefore, a community-based approach and direct assistance are essential so that all MSMEs, even those in remote locations, fully understand the procedures and advantages of OSS. This finding aligns with the analysis by Hapsari and Meirinawati, which emphasizes the need for active socialization through direct communication and digital training, as well as Damayanti, which indicates that assistance in NIB registration can hasten understanding and enhance business independence.

Clarity of Program Objectives

The clarity of the OSS program's objectives is evident in the supporting regulations, such as Government Regulations No. 24 of 2018 and No. 5 of 2021, which explicitly aim to simplify the licensing process, enhance information transparency, and expedite access for MSMEs to obtain NIB without requiring an in-person visit. These objectives are achievable and measurable, as evidenced by the increased service efficiency and the contribution of MSMEs, which accounts for over 60% of the national GDP. However, the clarity of these objectives still requires improvement due to inconsistencies in regulations across sectors and regions, along with features of OSS that are not yet fully integrated, meaning some steps still necessitate physical presence. This contradicts the operational principle of complete online services and poses difficulties for MSMEs located in areas with limited access. Therefore, the target plan should be more adaptable to attain more inclusive and equitable goals. Previous research by Christiawan supports this perspective, indicating that the OSS, as a tool for facilitating business operations, still faces challenges in integrating technical licensing, which obscures the clarity of targets for small and medium enterprises. Meanwhile, Nisak and Hertati, in their evaluation of SIPPADU as a comparison, highlight that the clarity of program objectives heavily relies on regulatory consistency, with confusion surrounding SIPPADU mirroring issues seen within OSS, thereby necessitating improvements to ensure objectives that are measurable and realistic for MSMEs.

Program Monitoring

The monitoring of the OSS program reveals ongoing oversight efforts from DPMPTSP, although there are still limitations in addressing various challenges. In terms of program flexibility and monitoring, DPMPTSP responded to feedback from SMEs

about system issues by collaborating with local villages, yet adjustments to the services remain constrained to technical problems like internet connectivity, without significant changes to the core features. This indicates that while monitoring has aided in identifying issues, there is a need for improved adaptability to better meet the needs of SMEs. On another note, concerning program monitoring and stability, the primary issues faced by OSS users include confusion about procedures, the need for clearer guidelines, and weak internet connectivity in rural areas, which complicates tasks like document uploads. This monitoring indicates that system stability is not yet at an optimal level, hence continuous evaluation is needed to enhance technical support and ensure the program effectively aids in the development of SMEs. Previous analysis by Damayanti highlighted the necessity for better oversight, emphasizing the continuous support for SMEs during the NIB registration process via OSS to address legal issues and technical challenges, thus strengthening system stability. Additionally, Hapsari and Meirinawati noted that the service improvement strategies at DPMPSTP Sidoarjo involve monitoring through regular evaluations, which assist in identifying barriers such as digital literacy, similar to findings in OSS.

CONCLUSION

Fundamental Finding : According to the research findings, the implementation of the Online Single Submission (OSS) system in Sidoarjo has proven effective in streamlining the permit application process, speeding up the issuance of Business Identification Numbers (NIB), and enhancing transparency in public service delivery, although challenges remain regarding varying levels of digital literacy and a lack of technical support for small SMEs. **Implication :** From an academic perspective, this study contributes insights into public policy effectiveness through Budiani's analytical approach, particularly in assessing the alignment among implementing organizations, target beneficiaries, and program objectives within the context of digital services at the local level. **Limitation :** The uniqueness of this research lies in its focus on the relationship between the digital readiness of SMEs and the success of OSS implementation, which has not been extensively studied before. **Future Research :** Therefore, recommendations include enhancing digital literacy through ongoing training, optimizing community-based outreach and assistance strategies, and simplifying OSS features to be more responsive and inclusive, ensuring that the online permit system is not only administratively efficient but also significantly impactful for the development of SMEs and local economic growth.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The author expresses gratitude to the Investment and One-Stop Integrated Services Office (DPMPSTP) of Sidoarjo Regency for their support and data access throughout this research, especially to Mr. Aris and Mr. Dian, who, as policy analysts, were willing to serve as resources. Thanks are also extended to the supervising lecturer for their valuable

guidance and feedback, as well as to family and friends who provided moral support and motivation, enabling the smooth and successful completion of this research.

REFERENCES

- [1] G. Santoso, M. Rizal, H. Wiyana, S. Nabila Subagja, U. Muhammadiyah Jakarta, and U. Teknologi Muhammadiyah Jakarta, "Digitalisasi UMKM: Strategi Dan Model Bisnis Berbasis Teknologi Untuk Keberlanjutan," *JUBISDIGI: Jurnal Bisnis Digital*, vol. 1, no. 01, pp. 1-10, 2025, [Online]. Available: <https://ejournal.utmj.ac.id/jubisdigi/about>
- [2] Aprieni, Farida Ratna Meilantika, Latriana Sihotang, and Febrina Vidya Rachma S, "UMKM Memiliki Peran Penting Dalam Perekonomian Indonesia," *Jurnal Ekonomi Bisnis Dan Manajemen*, vol. 2, no. 4, pp. 188-193, 2024, doi: 10.59024/jise.v2i4.976.
- [3] S. K. Arifin, Amirul Mustofa, Ika Devy Pramudiana, "Implementasi OSS dalam Pelayanan Perizinan Berusaha Terintegrasi Elektronik di Dinas Penanaman Modal dan PTSP," 2014.
- [4] M. R. EL FAJRI and S. J. WORO ASTUTI, "Efektivitas Sistem Perizinan Online Oss Rba (Online Single Submission Risk Based Approach) Terhadap Pengembangan Umkm Di Kabupaten Gresik," *JISP (Jurnal Inovasi Sektor Publik)*, vol. 4, no. 1, pp. 60-71, 2024, doi: 10.38156/jisp.v4i1.227.
- [5] E. Damayanti *et al.*, "Elvina Damayanti et al | Pendampingan UMKM dalam Pendaftaran NIB melalui sistem OSS Korespondensi: Pendampingan UMKM dalam Pendaftaran NIB melalui sistem OSS (Online Single Submission) sebagai Langkah Strategis Menuju Kemandirian dan Keberlanjutan Usaha di Kota Kediri." [Online]. Available: <https://jurnalfebi.iainkediri.ac.id/index.php/Welfare>
- [6] P. pemerintah R. Indonesia, "Peraturan Pemerintah RI Nomor 5 Tahun 2021 tentang Penyelenggaraan Perizinan Berusaha Berbasis Resiko," *Peraturan Pemerintah*, no. 087293, p. 390, 2021.
- [7] T. Ardea Pramesti *et al.*, "PENDAMPINGAN LEGALITAS UMKM NIB MELALUI SISTEM ONLINE SINGLE SUBMISSION (OSS) DI KELURAHAN SANANWETAN, SANANWETAN, KOTA BLITAR," vol. 1, no. 2, pp. 385-392, 2022, [Online]. Available: <https://etdci.org/journal/patikala/>
- [8] N. E. Wiranti, L. Magriasti, and A. Frinaldi, "Peranan Perangkat Desa Dalam Membantu Pelaku UMKM Mengembangkan Usahanya," *Journal Pendidikan Ilmu ...*, vol. 2024, no. 16, pp. 1-7, 2024, [Online]. Available: <https://e-journal.upr.ac.id/index.php/JP-IPS/article/view/14139%0Ahttps://e-journal.upr.ac.id/index.php/JP-IPS/article/download/14139/5912>
- [9] Rio Christiawan, "PERIZINAN BERBASIS ONLINE SINGLE SUBMISSION UNTUK MEWUJUDKAN KEMUDAHAN BERUSAHA," 2021.
- [10] Izzatun Nisak and D. Hertati, "Efektivitas Pelayanan Sistem Informasi Pelayanan Perizinan Terpadu (SIPPADU) di DPMPSTP Kabupaten Sidoarjo," *NeoRespublica: Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan*, vol. 5, no. 2, pp. 440-452, Feb. 2024, doi: 10.52423/neores.v5i2.221.
- [11] G. Bangsawan, "Kebijakan Akselerasi Transformasi Digital di Indonesia: Peluang dan Tantangan untuk Pengembangan Ekonomi Kreatif," *Jurnal Studi Kebijakan Publik*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 27-40, May 2023, doi: 10.21787/jskp.2.2023.27-40.
- [12] A. E. Rahmadani, Y. Pangestu, and N. Halizhah, "Media Hukum Indonesia (MHI) Published by Yayasan Daarul Huda Krueng Mane Analisis Penerapan Perizinan Berusaha Melalui Sistem Online Single Submission (OSS) Berbasis Resiko," vol. 2, no. 4, p. 174, doi: 10.5281/zenodo.14060525.
- [13] Nazwa Nurfauziah, Mawar Mawar, Fal Harmonis, and M Qudrat Nugraha, "Efektivitas Kebijakan Online Single Submission pada Dinas Penanaman Modal Pelayanan Terpadu Satu Pintu Tangerang Selatan," *Studi Administrasi Publik dan ilmu Komunikasi*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 192-207, Feb. 2025, doi: 10.62383/studi.v2i1.184.
- [14] M. Di Kabupaten Tabanan, st Kadek Putri Gayatri, nd I. Dewa Ayu Putri Wirantari, and rd Putu Nomy Yasintha, "Implementasi Program Perbantuan Lapangan Perizinan Berusaha

- Berbasis Online Single Submission Bagi Usaha Mikro, Kecil, Dan,” Online. [Online]. Available: <http://journals.ldpb.org/index.php/eljbn>
- [15] D. Purnamawati and H. Anadza, “EFEKTIVITAS PROGRAM APLIKASI SISTEM INFORMASI MOJOKERTO DALAM MENINGKATKAN PELAYANAN PUBLIK (Studi pada Dinas Penanaman Modal dan Pelayanan Terpadu Satu Pintu Kota Mojokerto),” 2022.
- [16] I. Hasibah, Hayat, and H. Anadza, “EFEKTIVITAS PROGRAM PELAYANAN ONLINE KEPENDUDUKAN DALAM MENINGKATKAN KUALITAS PELAYANAN PUBLIK (Studi Kasus Pada Dinas Kependudukan dan Pencatatan Sipil Kabupaten Gresik),” *Journal Publicuho*, vol. 5, no. 4, pp. 1027–1040, Nov. 2022, doi: 10.35817/publicuho.v5i4.47.
- [17] Meirinawati, “STRATEGI DALAM PENINGKATAN PELAYANAN PUBLIK MELALUI LAYANAN ONLINE SINGLE SUBMISSION (OSS) DI DINAS PENANAMAN MODAL DAN PELAYANAN TERPADU SATU PINTU (DPMPSTP) KABUPATEN SIDOARJO (STUDI KASUS PELAYANAN PERIZINAN BERUSAHA),” 2024.
- [18] Izzatun Nisak and D. Hertati, “Efektivitas Pelayanan Sistem Informasi Pelayanan Perizinan Terpadu (SIPPADU) di DPMPSTP Kabupaten Sidoarjo,” *NeoRespublica: Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan*, vol. 5, no. 2, pp. 440–452, Feb. 2024, doi: 10.52423/neores.v5i2.221.
- [19] Rio Christiawan, “PERIZINAN BERBASIS ONLINE SINGLE SUBMISSION UNTUK MEWUJUDKAN KEMUDAHAN BERUSAHA,” 2021.
- [20] M. W. Ilhami, W. Vera Nurfajriani, A. Mahendra, R. A. Sirodj, and W. Afgani, “Penerapan Metode Studi Kasus Dalam Penelitian Kualitatif,” *Jurnal Ilmiah Wahana Pendidikan*, vol. 10, no. 9, pp. 462–469, 2024, [Online]. Available: <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.11180129>
- [21] J. W. Creswell, *Research Design, Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*, Third edit. SAGE Publications, Inc. All, 2009.
- [22] G. Bowen, “Document Analysis as a Qualitative Research Method,” no. October, 2017, doi: 10.3316/QRJ0902027.
- [23] I. Lenaini, “Teknik Pengambilan Sampel Purposive Dan Snowball Sampling,” *HISTORIS: Jurnal Kajian, Penelitian & Pengembangan Pendidikan Sejarah*, vol. 6, no. 1, pp. 33–39, 2021, [Online]. Available: <http://journal.ummat.ac.id/index.php/historis>
- [24] Sugiyono, *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif: Teori dan Penerapannya*, vol. 2. 2024.
- [25] P. Spradley and M. Huberman, “Kajian Teoritis tentang Teknik Analisis Data dalam Penelitian Kualitatif: Perspektif Spradley, Miles dan Huberman,” vol. 1, no. 2, pp. 77–84, 2024.

Lefan Afitra Ferdiansah

Muhammadiyah University of Sidoarjo, Indonesia

Email: lefanferdi@gmail.com

***Eni Rustianingsih (Corresponding Author)**

Muhammadiyah University of Sidoarjo, Indonesia

Email: enirustianingsih@umsida.ac.id
