

Analysis of SIPPADU Success in Public Services at DPMPTSP Sidoarjo

M. Faishol Fatih¹, Ilmi Usrotin Choiriyah²

^{1,2}Muhammadiyah University of Sidoarjo, Indonesia



DOI : <https://doi.org/10.61796/icossh.v2i2.532>



Sections Info

Article history:

Submitted: August 25, 2025
Final Revised: September 07, 2025
Accepted: September 14, 2025
Published: September 26, 2025

Keywords:

Program success
SIPPADU
Digital public services
DPMPTSP
Licensing

ABSTRACT

Objective: This study aims to analyze the determining factors influencing the success of the Integrated Licensing Service Information System (SIPPADU) in Sidoarjo Regency as a digital-based public service innovation. **Method:** A descriptive qualitative approach was employed by analyzing official documents from the One-Stop Investment and Integrated Services Office (DPMPTSP) and conducting in-depth interviews with SIPPADU officers. The data were then interpreted to identify both internal and external factors contributing to program effectiveness. **Results:** The findings indicate that the success of the SIPPADU program is shaped by a synergy between technical and non-technical elements. Internally, the competence of officials, continuous training, robust technological infrastructure, and simplified service procedures form the foundation of efficiency. Externally, strong regulatory support, intensive social media dissemination, and proactive outreach initiatives enhance public engagement. Despite these achievements, challenges persist in the form of low digital literacy among older citizens and traditional MSME actors, which limits inclusivity. **Novelty:** This study provides a contextual framework for understanding how the integration of technological innovation, human resource development, and communication strategies can strengthen digital governance and promote broader public participation in e-government services.

INTRODUCTION

The transformation of public services in Indonesia towards digitalization is the country's top priority which aims to provide fast, transparent, and responsible services [1]. This digitization process is carried out by integrating information technology into the bureaucratic system, so that the public can access administrative procedures online [2]. This innovation not only speeds up the service process, but also reduces direct interactions that risk causing illegal levies, as well as expanding access to services for people in various regions. However, so far, public services in Indonesia are still often considered to have a complicated, slow, and prone to maladministration [3]. This situation has an impact on declining public trust and hampering the business climate, especially for Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises (UMKM) who often experience difficulties in obtaining business legality. This problem is increasingly evident after the pandemic, when the demand for digital services soared, while people's digital infrastructure and knowledge have not been fully evenly distributed [4].

As a solution step, the government introduced a digital-based licensing system that is easier, faster, and more transparent [5]. With this innovation, it is hoped that the level of public satisfaction with public services will increase while supporting economic growth nationally. One of the applications is the issuance of an online Business Identification Number (NIB), which facilitates business legality and facilitates MSMEs in accessing banking financing and a wider market [6].

These measures are supported by robust regulations. Law Number 25 of 2009 concerning Public Services emphasizes the principle of fast, easy, and affordable service as the minimum standard [7]. Government Regulation Number 24 of 2018 concerning Online Single Submission (OSS) simplifies the business licensing process nationally with a one-stop model [8]. Furthermore, Government Regulation Number 5 of 2021 concerning Risk-Based Business Licensing strengthens this policy by classifying businesses based on their risk level, so that verification can be carried out more quickly and precisely. This regulation is the basis for the national OSS system as well as regional models such as the Integrated Licensing Service Information System (SIPPADU) [9].

In Sidoarjo Regency, SIPPADU, which has been developed since 2011 by the One-Stop Investment and Integrated Services Office (DPMPTSP), is one of the leading innovations [10]. This system has undergone development from the initial SIPPADU to SIPPADU 2.0 and SIPPADU Next Generation, with integration into OSS and Building Management Information System (SIMBG) [11]. Various digital services are offered, including e-Forms, e-Surveys, and cross-agency verification through technical Regional Apparatus Organizations (OPD), such as the Environment Office, the Health Office, the Food and Agriculture Office, and the Transportation Office. The pick-up program is also implemented to support the legality of MSMEs, making SIPPADU a digital-based public service model that is nationally recognized.

Table 1. Development of NIB Issuance in Sidoarjo

Year	Number of NIB Issued (Sidoarjo)	Total National NIB	Information
2019	~1.500	1,2 million	Initial integration of Public Service Malls (MPP)
2020	1.300	1,4 million	Decline due to pandemic, pick-up of the ball begins
2021	>2.000	1,8 million	Integrasi OSS, adopsi digital naik 20%
2024–2025*	>2.500 (Estimation)	2,5 million (Estimation)	SIPPADU Next Gen, focus on non-digital UMKM

Source; Report DPMPTSP Sidoarjo, Situs OSS (2021–2025).

Table 1 shows a tendency to increase the issuance of NIB every year. Despite a decline in 2020 due to the pandemic, the number of NIBs skyrocketed again in 2021 in line with the integration of OSS. The forecast for 2024 to 2025 shows service attention to non-digital UMKM, which signals a more inclusive policy direction.

Table 2. Licensing Contribution to PAD

Year	PAD from Licensing (Rp Billion)	Percentage of Contribution PAD Total	Information
2019	12	~5%	Pra pandemic, stable
2020	9	~3%	Down 25% due to the pandemic
2021	20	~7%	Recovery via digitalization
2024–2025	>25 (Estimation)	~8% (Estimation)	Increasing UMKM investment

Source: Report DPMPTSP Sidoarjo (2020–2025).

By Table 2 showing the success of SIPPADU in contributing from the licensing sector to the Regional Original Revenue of Sidoarjo Regency. There was a considerable decline in 2020 due to the pandemic, but the implementation of digitalization policies was able to restore revenues in 2021 and is expected to continue to grow until 2025. This confirms that SIPPADU serves as the main source of PAD as well as a driver of MSME development.

Table 3. Community Satisfaction Level

Year/Survey	Satisfaction Percentage	Note
2019	85%	Survei internal pre-pandemic
2020	80%	Decline result pandemic
2021	90%	Increased adopsi digital
2024–2025*	90–92%	70% To group non-digital

Source: Report DPMPTSP (2020–2025)

Based on Table 3, it shows the level of public satisfaction with SIPADU services. The average satisfaction is above 85%, with the highest achievement of 92% in 2025. However, the satisfaction gap is still visible between digital users and non-digital groups, such as the elderly and traditional UMKM actors.

The results of the preliminary observations show that although SIPPADU has provided significant convenience in the permit application process, there are still some problems found on the ground. A number of applicants experienced technical difficulties such as invalid data, delays due to server problems, and low levels of digital understanding among some people, especially among traditional and elderly MSME actors. This situation creates an inequality in the use of digital services, where some people can enjoy services well, while others still require direct interaction. Therefore, it is very important to conduct further research on the factors that support the success of SIPPADU, both in terms of regulation, system innovation, the role of officers, and public acceptance. Knowledge of these success factors is expected to strengthen the

development of SIPPADU as an inclusive, efficient, and sustainable public service model in Sidoarjo Regency.

Based on previous studies, various studies have shown that the implementation of SIPPADU in Sidoarjo Regency has given positive results while facing various challenges. Research by Nurwindiarti reveals that SIPPADU is effective in improving access and efficiency in licensing services, although there are still technical and operational issues that need to be addressed. Furthermore, Oktariyanda study on Sippadu 2.0 emphasizes that the success of service innovation is influenced by clear management, culture of innovation, and technical capabilities, while challenges arise from resource limitations and data integration between agencies. Consistent with that, Nisak (2024) research shows that SIPPADU is considered effective in terms of timeliness and achievement of NIB issuance targets, but socialization to people who are not familiar with technology and technical issues such as data validation is still a significant weakness.

Therefore, it is necessary to have a deep understanding of the success of SIPPADU to find out the extent to which SIPPADU has succeeded in improving the quality of public services in DPMPTSP Sidoarjo and the factors that support and hinder this achievement. Thus, this study was compiled to answer the question: How successful is SIPPADU in improving the quality of public services in Sidoarjo Regency? This study aims to (1) analyze the success of the implementation of SIPPADU in internal and external aspects; (2) identify the factors that support and hinder the successful implementation.

RESEARCH METHOD

This study uses a descriptive qualitative approach to understand in depth how the efficiency of the Integrated Licensing Service Information System (SIPPADU) is implemented in Sidoarjo Regency [12]. According to Sugiyono (2018), the qualitative approach emphasizes on the study of phenomena in natural conditions with the researcher as the main instrument, while the descriptive method is used to describe the situation factually without the intention of generalizing [13]. The location of the research is centered at the Sidoarjo Regency Investment and One-Stop Integrated Services Office (DPMPTSP), as the agency responsible for the management of SIPPADU. The research informant is a SIPPADU officer who is directly involved in the licensing service process so that he can provide in-depth information about procedures, obstacles, and system achievements [14]. The source of research data is dominated by secondary data, in the form of official documents and reports of DPMPTSP and relevant previous research results. Moleong stated that documents are a rich, consistent, and reliable source of information, so they are worthy of being used as the main analysis material [15]. In addition, primary data was obtained in a limited way through in-depth interviews with SIPPADU officers and simple observations of the service process. Data analysis used the interactive model of Miles and Huberman, which consisted of the stages of data reduction, data presentation, and conclusion drawing and verification. The validity of the data is strengthened by the source triangulation technique, which is comparing

information from interviews, documents, and observations, and conducting member checks on informants to ensure the accuracy of the data obtained [16].

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Results

Internal Factors Supporting SIPPADU Success

Internal factors that help the success of SIPPADU include human resources, technological infrastructure, and policies in place within the organization. These three elements serve as the main basis that determines how well the digital service system can be operated.

Table 4. Internal Factors Influencing Success SIPPADU

Internal Factors	Description of Field Findings (2025)	Major Obstacles & Specific Data
Human Resources	Trained officers; satisfied with the training. Interview: "Training Monthly helps efficiency" (Aris, 2025).	Lack of dedicated staff IT.
Technology Infrastructure	Uptime : e-Formulir efektif. Observation: Seamless online process.	Error Report Data Validation DPMPTSP 2024.
Internal Policy	SOP berjenjang; izin tepat waktu.	Cross-coordination OPD slow.

Source: Interview, Researcher Observations, Reports DPMPTSP (2025)

Based on Table 4, it shows that the internal elements that support the success of SIPPADU in DPMPTSP Sidoarjo consist of three main components: human resources, technological infrastructure, and internal policies. From the aspect of human resources, officers are considered to have adequate competence thanks to the training that is routinely carried out, which accelerates the service process. However, the lack of dedicated IT staff is still an obstacle. In terms of technology infrastructure, the e-Form system works well and the integration with OSS speeds up the process, although it still faces problems such as errors in data validation. Meanwhile, in terms of internal policies, the existence of clear SOPs and tiered procedures has helped to complete permits on time, although coordination between OPDs often causes delays. Overall, internal elements have a positive impact on the success of SIPPADU, but still need improvement, especially in the technical field and collaboration between agencies.

In terms of human resources (SDM), the success of SIPPADU is highly dependent on the ability of employees to carry out their duties. Based on an interview with Mr. Aris, as a Policy Analyst at DPMPTSP, it is stated that; *"Training that is carried out regularly allows the permit verification process to be completed within 1-3 days. Most applications can be completed according to standard operating procedures, although some are held back due to incomplete paperwork."* (Wawancara 15 April, 2025). This statement emphasizes that improving staff capabilities through continuous training plays a major role in accelerating services and ensuring that procedures remain consistent. These findings

support the opinion of Oktariyanda who states that innovation in employee management is one of the important aspects of SIPPADU's success. However, this is also in line with the findings of Nisak which shows that there are still limitations in mastery of technology that are obstacles to digital services in several regions. Therefore, it can be concluded that human resources provide good support for the implementation of SIPPADU, although there are still obstacles related to imperfections of documents from the applicant.

Furthermore, regarding the technological infrastructure factor, system integration is a key element that helps accelerate services. Mr. Aris revealed: *"The integration of SIPPADU with OSS has accelerated the verification process, but errors in data validation, such as invalid ID numbers, are still common due to incomplete documents submitted."* (15 April, 2025) These findings show that the use of digital technology is able to improve efficiency, although it is not yet completely free from technical problems. These findings are in line with Nisak's research which identified technical issues as one of the main obstacles in digital services, while Oktariyanda is more optimistic about the continued success of SIPPADU 2.0. This means that the technological infrastructure is quite supportive, but it still needs improvement, especially in the part of the data validation system.

Internal policy factors also function as a regulator for the running of the program. Pak Aris emphasized: *"Our internal policy is clear, every permit must follow a tiered procedure. However, there are often slight delays in coordination with technical OPD."* (Interview, 15 April 2025). This statement shows that although internal policies can maintain the effectiveness of services through a structured mechanism, implementation still faces obstacles in coordination between OPD. Oktariyanda research (2023) noted that coordination between OPDs is quite good, so this finding provides a new view that interaction between agencies is still a challenge in the implementation of SIPPADU.

Overall, internal factors provide support for the success of SIPPADU through improved human resource capabilities, technology integration, and clear implementation of internal policies. However, this effectiveness has not been fully maximized due to obstacles such as incompleteness of documents, technical errors in data validation, and delays in coordination between agencies.

External Factors Supporting SIPPADU Success

In addition to internal factors, the success of SIPPADU is also influenced by support from various parties, the extent to which the community adopts this service, regulations from the central government, and the impact on the economy. These external factors show how the context outside the organization also affects the quality of digital services.

Table 5. External Factors Influencing the Success of SIPPADU

External Factors	Description of Field Findings (2025)	Major Obstacles & Specific Data
Stakeholder Support	OPD integration is good; Social Media Effective socialization. Interview: "Social media Increase Applications" (Aris, 2025).	Coordination across agencies is slow.

External Factors	Description of Field Findings (2025)	Major Obstacles & Specific Data
Community Adoption	Interview : Webinar socialization helps.	Low digital literacy
National Regulations	PP 5/2021 support OSS; >2.500 NIB.	Adaptation of new regulations by UMKM.
Economic Impact	PAD >Rp25 Billion; investment UMKM rises.	Pandemic fluctuations (go down 25%, 2020).

Source: Interviews, Researcher Observations, Reports DPMPTSP (2025)

Based on Table 5, that *external factors* that affect the success of SIPPADU include support from stakeholders, public acceptance, national regulations, and economic effects. Support from stakeholders can be seen through OPD cooperation and counseling through social media platforms, although sometimes inter-agency arrangements are slow. The level of public acceptance is quite good, especially among young people thanks to digital campaigns, but the low digital literacy ability in the elderly group and traditional MSMEs is still an obstacle. In terms of regulations, the existence of Government Regulation No. 5 of 2021 is the legal basis that strengthens the implementation of OSS and SIPPADU. On the economic side, SIPPADU has contributed to increasing regional PAD and triggering the growth of MSMEs, even though it was affected by the pandemic in 2020. Thus, external factors show that the success of SIPPADU is supported by regulations and stakeholders, and has a positive impact on the economy, although it still faces challenges in digital literacy and inter-institutional regulation.

Support from *stakeholders* is a crucial component in increasing the legitimacy and efficiency of services. In an interview, Mr. Aris said that: *“Collaboration with technical OPD has been running smoothly, especially in terms of document verification. This speeds up the licensing process, although sometimes coordination still takes time.”* (Interview, 15 April, 2025). This shows that there is a solid partnership between DPMPTSP and technical OPD, although obstacles in coordination still exist. This finding is in line with the statement of Nurwindiarti who emphasized that cooperation between institutions is very important for the effectiveness of digital-based licensing.

The level of adoption of services by the community is also an important factor. Mr. Aris explained: *“Socialization through Instagram is effective for the younger generation, but we need more active programs to reach the elderly and traditional UMKM”* (Interview, 15 April 2025) This shows that public acceptance is already quite high among digital users, but still low among those who are not familiar with technology. This situation is in line with the findings of Nisak which revealed that low digital literacy is the main obstacle in technology-based services. Therefore, community participation tends to be positive, but does not fully include all groups.

Regulatory factors from the government also play an important role in supporting the success of SIPPADU. Mr. Aris said: "*Our legal basis is very clear, Government Regulation No. 5 of 2021 fully supports risk-based licensing. This rule is very helpful in speeding up the process and providing legal certainty.*" (Interview, April 15, 2025). This shows that regulation is an important basis for the legitimacy of the program. This finding is in line with the research of Nurwindiarti who stated that the existence of regulations improves service efficiency.

Finally, the economic influence of SIPPADU is also quite significant. Mr. Aris added: "*SIPPADU helps MSMEs to get legality, so that they can more easily access the market and financing. This contributes to the improvement of the regional economy.*" (Interview, April 15, 2025). These findings show that SIPPADU is more than just an innovation in administration, but also plays an important role as a driver of the local economy. Mahmood et al emphasized that the success of e-government should be measured by the real impact felt by the community, including in terms of the economy.

External factors indicate that SIPPADU success is supported by collaboration with various stakeholders, acceptance of services by the digital community, strong national regulations, and contribution to the local economy. However, this success has not been completely evenly distributed because there are still obstacles such as low digital literacy among the elderly and traditional business actors, which hinders the process of comprehensive service adoption and causes disparities in the level of participation and benefits felt by all levels of society.

Discussion

The findings of this study reinforce that the success of the SIPPADU program is the result of effective integration between internal management capabilities and external environmental support. Internally, the enhancement of human resource competence through continuous training has proven crucial in adapting to system updates and maintaining service consistency. The stable technological infrastructure and the use of integrated systems such as OSS have strengthened administrative efficiency and minimized processing delays. However, technical constraints—particularly in data validation and the limited number of IT personnel—still create barriers to achieving optimal service quality. These findings support the concept of digital bureaucracy proposed by Dunleavy et al. (2006), which emphasizes that the effectiveness of e-government relies not only on technology but also on the capacity and professionalism of civil servants managing it.

From an external perspective, the study highlights the vital role of government regulation and community participation in determining the program's success. The enactment of Government Regulation No. 5 of 2021 on Risk-Based Licensing has strengthened the legitimacy and standardization of SIPPADU operations, aligning them with the national OSS system. The DPMPTSP's proactive "pick-up the ball" strategy and socialization through social media have effectively increased participation among the younger generation and new business actors. However, the persistence of low digital literacy among elderly citizens and traditional MSME actors underscores a gap in service

inclusivity. This condition supports previous research by Nurlaila et al. (2024), which found that digital inequality remains a major obstacle to achieving equitable access to e-government services, particularly in rural and semi-urban contexts.

Theoretically, this study contributes to the discourse on e-government implementation by emphasizing the interdependence between technological innovation, regulatory frameworks, and social adaptation. The success of digital public services such as SIPPADU cannot be separated from the ability of local governments to balance internal readiness with external responsiveness. Practically, the findings imply that local governments must continue to invest in digital literacy programs, enhance the technical capacity of apparatus, and expand outreach to marginalized groups to ensure inclusive participation. Future development of SIPPADU should focus on system optimization through real-time data validation, inter-agency integration, and adaptive policy design. These measures are expected to strengthen the sustainability of digital public service innovations and further position Sidoarjo Regency as a leading model of local e-government transformation in Indonesia.

CONCLUSION

Fundamental Finding : This study concludes that the success of the Integrated Licensing Service Information System (SIPPADU) in Sidoarjo Regency's DPMPTSP is the result of a synergistic integration between internal and external factors. Internally, the enhancement of human resource competence through continuous training and the support of stable technological infrastructure have significantly improved operational efficiency, despite persisting issues such as limited IT staff and data validation errors. Externally, effective digital outreach strategies and the strengthening of national regulations have increased community engagement and reinforced SIPPADU's role in supporting regional investment. **Implication :** The findings emphasize that sustainable success in e-government initiatives requires not only technological readiness and bureaucratic adaptation but also active public participation and inclusive digital literacy programs. **Limitation :** This study is limited by its qualitative scope, focusing solely on one regional office, which may not fully capture variations in implementation across different administrative contexts. **Future Research :** Further studies should employ mixed-method approaches to evaluate user satisfaction, measure service efficiency quantitatively, and explore strategies to bridge digital literacy gaps among marginalized groups to ensure equitable access to digital public services.

REFERENCES

- [1] K. Tauhid *et al.*, "Transformasi Administrasi Publik Diera Digital," vol. 3, pp. 8206-8212, 2024.
- [2] Nurlaila Nurlaila, Zuriatin Zuriatin, and Nurhasanah Nurhasanah, "Transformasi Digital Pelayanan Publik: Tantangan dan Prospek dalam Implementasi E-Government di Kabupaten Bima," *Public Service and Governance Journal*, vol. 5, no. 2, pp. 21-37, 2024, doi: 10.56444/psgj.v5i2.1468.

- [3] M. Imania, Pramudiana. Devy Ika, and S. Kamariyah, "Inovasi Pelayanan Publik Berbasis Aplikasi Sistem Informasi Administrasi Kependudukan di Kantor Kecamatan Torjun Kabupaten Sampang," *Inovasi Pelayanan Publik Berbasis Aplikasi Sistem Informasi Administrasi Kependudukan*, vol. 2, no. 2, pp. 325–336, 2024.
- [4] T. Ardea Pramesti *et al.*, "PENDAMPINGAN LEGALITAS UMKM NIB MELALUI SISTEM ONLINE SINGLE SUBMISSION (OSS) DI KELURAHAN SANANWETAN, SANANWETAN, KOTA BLITAR," vol. 1, no. 2, pp. 385–392, 2022, [Online]. Available: <https://etdci.org/journal/patikala/>
- [5] U. Di and L. Bajo, "PERAN PEMERINTAH DAERAH TERHADAP TRANSFORMASI DIGITAL PADA," 2025.
- [6] E. Damayanti *et al.*, "Elvina Damayanti et al | Pendampingan UMKM dalam Pendaftaran NIB melalui sistem OSS Korespondensi: Pendampingan UMKM dalam Pendaftaran NIB melalui sistem OSS (Online Single Submission) sebagai Langkah Strategis Menuju Kemandirian dan Keberlanjutan Usaha di Kota Kediri." [Online]. Available: <https://jurnalfebi.iainkediri.ac.id/index.php/Welfare>
- [7] K. Khoirunnisa and D. Jubaidi, "Transformasi Pelayanan Publik: Evaluasi Terhadap Implementasi Undang-Undang Pelayanan Publik No. 25/2009 Di Indonesia," *The Indonesian Journal of ...*, vol. 10, 2024, [Online]. Available: <https://journal.uta45jakarta.ac.id/index.php/admpublik/article/view/7233%0Ahttps://journal.uta45jakarta.ac.id/index.php/admpublik/article/viewFile/7233/2872>
- [8] R. K. Suryadevi and E. H. Fanida, "Inovasi Program Online Single Submission (OSS) Dalam Layanan Izin Usaha Di Dinas Penanaman Modal Dan Pelayanan Terpadu Satu Pintu Kabupaten Sidoarjo," *Publika*, vol. 8, no. 1, 2020, [Online]. Available: <https://jurnalmahasiswa.unesa.ac.id/index.php/publika/article/view/32573>
- [9] S. K. Arifin, Amirul Mustofa, Ika Devy Pramudiana, "Implementasi OSS dalam Pelayanan Perizinan Berusaha Terintegrasi Elektronik di Dinas Penanaman Modal dan PTSP," 2014.
- [10] M. R. EL FAJRI and S. J. WORO ASTUTI, "Efektivitas Sistem Perizinan Online Oss Rba (Online Single Submission Risk Based Approach) Terhadap Pengembangan Umkm Di Kabupaten Gresik," *JISP (Jurnal Inovasi Sektor Publik)*, vol. 4, no. 1, pp. 60–71, 2024, doi: 10.38156/jisp.v4i1.227.
- [11] I. Hasibah, Hayat, and H. Anadza, "EFEKTIVITAS PROGRAM PELAYANAN ONLINE KEPENDUDUKAN DALAM MENINGKATKAN KUALITAS PELAYANAN PUBLIK (Studi Kasus Pada Dinas Kependudukan dan Pencatatan Sipil Kabupaten Gresik)," *Journal Publicuho*, vol. 5, no. 4, pp. 1027–1040, Nov. 2022, doi: 10.35817/publicuho.v5i4.47.
- [12] M. W. Ilhami, W. Vera Nurfajriani, A. Mahendra, R. A. Sirodj, and W. Afgani, "Penerapan Metode Studi Kasus Dalam Penelitian Kualitatif," *Jurnal Ilmiah Wahana Pendidikan*, vol. 10, no. 9, pp. 462–469, 2024, [Online]. Available: <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.11180129>
- [13] Sugiyono, *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif: Teori dan Penerapannya*, vol. 2. 2024.
- [14] Y. Citriadin, *Teknik analisis data penelitian kualitatif dan penelitian kuantitatif dalam metodologi penelitian pendekatan multidisipliner*. 2020.
- [15] J. W. Creswell, *Research Design, Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*, Third edit. SAGE Publications, Inc. All, 2009.
- [16] P. Spradley and M. Huberman, "Kajian Teoritis tentang Teknik Analisis Data dalam Penelitian Kualitatif: Perspektif Spradley, Miles dan Huberman," vol. 1, no. 2, pp. 77–84, 2024.

M. Faishol Fatih

Muhammadiyah University of Sidoarjo, Indonesia

Email: faisholfatih606@gmail.com

*** Ilmi Usrotin Choiriyah (Corresponding Author)**

Muhammadiyah University of Sidoarjo, Indonesia

Email: ilmiusrotin@umsida.ac.id
